

SOME OBSERVATIONS ON LITERARY TRANSLATIONS FROM ROMANIAN INTO MACEDONIAN AND VICE VERSA

Constantin-Ioan Mladin

'Ss. Cyril and Methodius' University in Skopje

Republic of Macedonia

ABSTRACT

This study pursues the objectives listed below in a consecutively logical order: 1) to list the Romanian literary translations into Macedonian (and vice versa) completed in the last decade and a half; 2) to critically judge the volume, representativeness, and quality of the translations; 3) to present a few perspectives and proposals regarding the desirable improvement of the subject area's status quo, in the near future.

KEYWORDS

Macedonian literature, Romanian literature, translation

1. THE METHODOLOGY USED OF THE RESEARCH.

The translations were grouped into two sections: 1) *Translations of Romanian literature into Macedonian* and 2) *Translations of Macedonian literature into Romanian*. The number of editorial entities for each section is indicated in brackets. In fact, this data may prove to be misleading because: 1) some of the listed titles are anthological collections of fragments from the work of a single author or of different authors, of varying length and more or less eloquent for the portrait of a certain writer or for a particular section in one of the two literatures (generically, they have been called anthologies here), so the number of listed authors is greater; 2) several authors appear in different positions with different works, so the number of these authors is lower, in this case.

The translations were arranged in the following order: ascending chronological order, followed by the alphabetical order of the authors, by family name and by following the succession of the letters in the two alphabets (Latin and Cyrillic).

Several exceptions to this general principle were necessary: 1) the collective works (florilegium) were arranged as if their title were the name of the author; 2) works with insufficient or unclear chronological information were placed either at the end of the list or in a footnote.

The main part of the research is actually made up of a corpus of bibliographic references of literary translations from Romanian into Macedonian and vice versa, completed in the last decade and a half. This information has been arranged according to the following general principle: the author's name – the bio-note of the author – only for the Macedonian authors (in a footnote, once, at its first occurrence in the text) – title of the work – original title, place, and year of publication – only for Macedonian works (in another footnote) – a schematic indication of the literary genre of the work – the name of the translator / translators, followed (in a footnote, only for the first occurrence) by their bio-note (for Macedonian translators only). Sometimes, due to lack of bibliographic information, some of these data may be missing. If the title of a volume, a selection from an artist's lyrical work, for example, was given by one of the works contained in that volume, the indication of the source was no longer possible. The names of writers and translators have been written in both alphabets so as to easily overcome some of the difficulties that may arise in the transliteration process. Instead of the purely value profile of those personalities (the intrinsic value of the work, from an aesthetic point of view, the contribution of the author to the development of literature, etc.), the notes rather aim to provide an image of the administrative status of the writers, in a possible hierarchy of the guild. This aspect demonstrates that the selection of authors whose work was translated from one language into another, as in other cultural spaces and as in all times, has been strongly influenced by such a tragically conjectural criterion.

Since there is no bibliography specifically devoted to this very specific theme and since the corpus of the article is built out of bibliographic references, placing a list of works at the end of the text would not have been meaningful and would have given a repulsive aspect to the whole presentation¹.

2. THE CORPUS OF ROMANIAN LITERATURE TRANSLATIONS INTO MACEDONIAN AND VICE VERSA.

Inevitably, the following lines bring together Macedonian translations of well-known Romanian authors with translations of the works of minor writers in the relative value hierarchy of Romanian literature, as well as important authors in

¹ Abbreviations: MASA – Macedonian Academy of Sciences and Arts (Maced. Македонска Академија на Науките и Уметностите), PEN (PEN Club International – with the branch corresponding to each of the two countries), WAM – Writers' Association of Macedonia (Maced. Друштво на писателите на Македонија).

the Macedonian literary landscape with Macedonian authors less well-known in national literature and whose works have been translated into Romanian. This axiologically questionable mix remains outside of the objectives pursued by the present study, and ultimately reflects the actual situation in the literature of the two countries, not inconsistent with the situation in other cultural spaces.

2. 1. TRANSLATIONS OF ROMANIAN LITERATURE INTO MACEDONIAN:

1) Мирча Чобану [Mircea Ciobanu (lyrics; anthology), in ЕФТИМ КЛЕТНИКОВ², *Хоризонти на зборот*. Скопје: Менора, 2000.

2) Каролина Илика [Carolina Ilica, *Беседа за Прличев / Discurs despre Prlicev* (lyrics; bilingual Romanian-Macedonian text; edition supervised by Dumitru M. Ion). Охрид: Национална установа – Завод за заштита на спомениците на културата и Музеј, 2008.

3) *Звукот на зборот. Тројца романски поети* (Николае Григоре Марашану [Nicolae Grigore Mărășanu], Константин Ѓерѓиноју [Constantin Gherghinoiu], Стере Буковала [Stere Bucovaľă]) – (lyrics; anthology; translation: Dimo Dimcev³). Смедерево: Арка, 2009.

4) Стере Буковала, *Попладнињата на едно пијано [Дирă-амезџиле или пијано]* (translation: Dina Cuvata și Gane Todorovski⁴). Скопје: Матица Македонска, 2009;

5) Еуџен Урикару [Eugen Uricaru], *Клада и пламен [Rug și flacără]* (novel; translation: Dimo Dimcev). Скопје: Макавеј, 2010.

6) *Деветмина романски поети [Noiș proeși români]* (Гелу Наум [Gellu Naum], Марин Сореску [Marin Sorescu], Илеана Маланчоју [Ileana Mălăncioiu], Јоан Ес. Поп [Ioan Es. Pop], Андреј Бодиу [Andrei Bodiu], Василе Багиу [Vasile Baghiu], Аугустин Јоан [Augustin Ioan], Кајус Добреску [Caius Dobrescu], Сорин Ѓерѓуц [Sorin Gherguț]) – (lyrics; anthology; translation: Lidija Dimkovska⁵), in the *AK* literature and art magazine, n° 40 / 41, 2011, p. 48-53.

² Eftim Kletnikov (ЕФТИМ КЛЕТНИКОВ; 1946-), poet, literary critic, essayist and Macedonian translator.

³ Dina Cuvata (alias Dimo Dimcev, the Macedonian name: ДИМО НАУМ ДИМЧЕВ; 1952-), economist, writer and Macedonian translator of Aromanian origin, member of WAM.

⁴ Gane Todorovski (ГАНЕ ТОДОРОВСКИ; 1929-2010), professor, writer, essayist, critic and literary historian, publicist and Macedonian translator.

⁵ Lidija Dimkovska (ЛИДИЈА ДИМКОВСКА; 1971-), poet, essayist, Macedonian prose writer, currently based in Slovenia, PhD student (2000) and a Macedonian lecturer at the Faculty of Foreign Languages and Literature of the University of Bucharest, editor of the *Блесок* electronic journal of culture and art, member of WAM and PEN.

- 7) КОНСТАНТИН АБАЛУЦА [Constantin Abăluță, *ИМагинарни случки од букурешките улици* [*Întâmplări imaginare pe străzile Bucureștiului*] (novel; in eBook format; translation: Lidija Dimkovska). Скопје: Блесок, 2011).
- 8) МИРЧЕА КАРТАРЕСКУ [Mircea Cărtărescu], *Носталгија* [*Nostalgia*] (novel / short prose; translation: Ermis Lafazanovski⁶). Скопје: Икона, 2011.
- 9) КАРОЛИНА ИЛИКА [Carolina Ilica], *Малку повеќе* [*Puțin mai mult*] (lyrics; preface: Mateja Matevski⁷; postface: Rade Silian⁸; translation: Mihail Rengiov⁹, Vesna Ațevska¹⁰, Dimo Dimcev). Скопје: Матица Македонска, 2011.
- 10) ДУМИТРУ М. ИОН [Dumitru M. Ion, *Јован Метатофа* / *John Metaphor* [*Ioan Metafora*] (lyrics; bilingual English-Macedonian edition; translation: Dimo Dimcev). Скопје: Макавеј, 2012.
- 11) ЛУЧИЈАН ДАН ТОДОРОВИЌ [Lucian Dan Teodorovici], *Другите љубовни приказни* [*Celelalte povești de dragoste*] (novel; translation: Ermis Lafazanovski). Скопје: Икона, 2013.
- 12) МИРЧЕА КАРТАРЕСКУ [Mircea Cărtărescu], *Заслепување – Лево крило* [*Orbitor. Aripa stângă*] (novel; translation: Ermis Lafazanovski). Скопје: Икона, 2014.
- 13) ДОЈНА РУШТИ [Doina Ruști], *Елиза на единаесет години* [*Lizoaanca la 11 ani*] (novel; translation: Александра Каитозис¹¹). Скопје: Издава Антолог, 2015.

⁶ Ermis Lafazanovski (Ермис Лафазановски; 1961-; born in Romania), a researcher at the 'Марко Цепенков' Folklore Institute (Skopje), Macedonian prose writer and translator, member of WAM and current president of PEN.

⁷ Mateja Matevski (Матеја Матевски; 1929-), Mateja Matevski (Матеја Матевски, 1929-), poet, essayist, literary and dramatic critic, Macedonian translator, journalist and editor and director of Macedonian Radio, former MASA president.

⁸ Раде Силјан (1950-), a Macedonian poet, essayist, critic and translator, a former journalist at 'Студентски збор', 'Наш свет', 'Железничке новине', director of the 'Македонска книга' Publishing House and the 'Матица македонска' Publishing House, Macedonian, former president of WAM, member of the Association of Macedonian Translators, PEN, of the 'Mihai Eminescu' International Academy in Craiova. Ten years earlier, Rade Silian had already been translated and published in Romanian: *Zidirea Umbrei* (*Зацудување на скалката*, Скопје: Култура, 1990) – (translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). Bucharest: Orient-Occident Publishing House, 1993.

⁹ Mihail Rengiov (Михаил Ренцов; 1936-), lawyer, poet, prose writer and Macedonian translator, member of WAM and PEN. Mihail Rengiov was himself translated into Romanian: *Poezia și fluturele* (lyrics; translation: Dumitru M. Ion). Bucharest: Cartea Românească Publishing House, 1981; *Intrarea în Ierusalim* (*Влезување во Ерусалим*, 1993; translation by Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). Bucharest: Orient-Occident Publishing House, 1995.

¹⁰ Vesna Ațevska (Весна Ацевска; 1952-), poet, narrator and Macedonian translator. Vesna Ațevska was translated into Romanian: *Causa Sum* (translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). Bucharest: Orient-Occident Publishing House, 1995.

¹¹ Alexandra Kaitozis (maced. Александра Каитозис; 1985-), Macedonian-Romanian translator, graduate of the Faculty of Letters of 'Alexandru Ioan Cuza' University of Iasi.

14) Лучијан Блага [Lucian Blaga], *Метафизичка тага* [*Tristețe metafizică*] (poetry). Скопје: Макавеј (onwards 2000);

15) *Антологија на балканскиот афоризам* [*Antologia aforismului balcanic*] (Валериу Бутулеску [Valeriu Butulescu], Василе Ѓика [Vasile Ghica], Јонуц Караџа [Ionuț Caragea], Иоан Ромошан [Ioan Romoșan]). (aphorisms; in online format: <http://www.vasiltolevski.mk>; translation: Vasil Tolevski¹²).

16) Симона Грација-Дима [Simona-Grazia Dima], *Антологија на современката романска книжевност во превод на македонски* [*Antologia literaturii române contemporane în traducere macedoneană*] (Василе Багњу [Vasile Baghiu], Думитру Киоару [Dumitru Chioaru], Аура Кристи [Aura Christi], Симона-Грација Дима [Simona-Grazia Dima], Гелу Дориан [Gellu Dorian], Николае Прелипчану [Nicolae Prelipceanu], Константин Абалуца [Constantin Abăluță], Габриел Кифу [Gabriel Chifu], Никита Данилов [Nichita Danilov], Раду Павел Гео [Radu Pavel Gheo], Георге Шварц [Gheorghe Schwartz], Раду Ф. Александру [Radu F. Alexandru], Моника Спиридон [Monica Spiridon], Корин Брага [Corin Braga]) – (poetry, prose, dramaturgy; in electronic format: <http://diversity.org.mk/>; translation: Simona-Grația Dima). Меѓународно списание за книжевност у уметност, Колекција за поезија, фикција и есеј на Меѓународниот – Diversity – Diversité – Diversidad – Разноликост (under the aegis of PEN; onwards 2007).

17) Адријан Алуј Георге [Adrian Alui Gheorghe], *Лажка* [*Laika*] (novel; translation: Ирина Кроткова¹³). Скопје: Македоника литера, 2017.

18) Филип Флоријан [Filip Florian], *Малите прсти* [*Degete mici*] (novel, but published in a collection of essays; translation: Ирина Кроткова). Скопје: Или-или, 2017.

2. 2. TRANSLATIONS OF MACEDONIAN LITERATURE INTO ROMANIAN:

1) Lidija Dimkovska, *Meta-spânzurare de meta-tei* (lyrics; anthology; translation: Constantin Abăluță). București: Vinea, 2001.

2) Savo Kostadinovski¹⁴, *Poezie despre poezie / Поезија за поезијата* (lyrics; bilingual Macedonian-Romanian text; translation: Dumitru M. Ion). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2002.

¹² Vasil Tolevski (Васил Толевски; 1956-), professional athlete, humorist and Macedonian satirical writer.

¹³ Irina Krotkova (Ирина Кроткова), ministerial civil servant, poet, prose writer, translator and Macedonian journalist, former Macedonian lecturer at the University of Craiova (1987-1991) and Istanbul, former WAM president.

¹⁴ Savo Kostadinovski (Саво Костадиновски; 1950-), Macedonian poet.

- 3) Katița Kiulavkova¹⁵, *Dorințe*¹⁶ (lyrics; also available in *eBook* format; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilinca). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2003.
- 4) Rade Silian, *Amarul Vilaet*¹⁷ (lyrics; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2007.
- 5) Milovan Stefanovski¹⁸, poems in 'Ramuri', n° 5, 2007 (<http://revistaramuri.ro/articole.php>).
- 6) Dejan Dukovski¹⁹, *Butoiul cu pulbere*²⁰. In *Dramaturgie contemporană din Balcani*, in 'Teatrul azi' – supplement. (dramaturgy). București, 2008.
- 7) Bojin Pavlovski²¹, *Frumoasa și profanatorul*²². (novel; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica), București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2008.
- 8) Bojin Pavlovski, *Iarnă în plină vară*²³. (novel; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2008.
- 9) Bojin Pavlovski, *Ipcritul roșu*²⁴. (novel; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2008.
- 10) Bojin Pavlovski, *Western Australia*²⁵. (novel; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2008.

¹⁵ Catița Kiulakova (Катица Кулавакова; 1951-), former Macedonian language lecturer in Paris, professor of literature theory at the Faculty of Philology of the 'St. Kiril and Metodiu' University (Skopje), former president of PEN, WAM, MASA.

¹⁶ *Дива мисла*. Скопје: Мисла, 1989.

¹⁷ *Горчлив вилает*. Скопје: Матица Македонска 2006.

¹⁸ Milovan Stefanovski (Милован Стефановски; 1952-), ministerial civil servant, poet, prose writer, translator and Macedonian journalist, former Macedonian lecturer at the University of Craiova (1987-1991) and Istanbul, former WAM president.

¹⁹ Dejan Dukovski (Дејан Дуковски; 1969-), contemporary Macedonian playwright, former playwright at Macedonian Radio, currently a teacher at the Faculty of Dramatic Arts at the 'St. Kiril and Metodiu' University (Skopje), member of PEN.

²⁰ *Буре барут*. 1994.

²¹ Bojin Pavlovski (Божин Павловски; 1942-), Macedonian writer, member of MASA. Bojin Pavlovski had already been published in Romanian, in the translation of the same translators, with the novel: *Ipcritul roșu* (*Црвениот хипокрит*. Скопје: Мисла, 1985). Bucharest: Cartea Românească Publishing House, 1986.

²² *Убавицата и Мародерот*. Мелбурн: АЕА, 2006.

²³ *Зима во лето*. Скопје: Матица и Мисла, 2007.

²⁴ *Црвениот хипокрит*. Скопје: Македонска Книга, 1984.

²⁵ *Вест Ауст*. Скопје: Мисла, 1977.

- 11) Bojin Pavlovski, *Visătoarea egipteană*²⁶. (novel; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident, 2010.
- 12) Goran Stefanovski²⁷, *Povești din Estul Sălbatic* (*Fundul dublu, Gaura neagră, Ex-Yu, Bacchanalia*²⁸, *Demonul din Debarmaalo*²⁹, *Povești din Estul Sălbatic*³⁰, *Monologul lui Zoran*) – (dramaturgy; anthology; translation and preface: Ioana Ieronim). București: Editura Cheiron, 2010.
- 13) Dina Cuvata, *Învățăturile mamei; Ca o suflare; Deșteptarea aromânilor; Nu vă atingeți de poezia mea; În cine să se-ncreadă omul?* (lyrics; translation: Dimo Dimcev, alias Dina Cuvata). In Irina Lucia Mihalca, *Poezie macedoneană*, in *Casa Gândului – Cleopatra*, 2012 (*Rețeaua Literară*: in electronic format: <http://reteualiterara.ning.com>).
- 14) Lidija Dimkovska, *Diferență* (lyrics; Constantin Abăluță³¹, Ioana Ieronim³², Dagmar Maria Anoca in Dagmar Maria Anoca). București: Tracus Arte, 2012.
- 15) Ivan Geparovski³³, *Sedimente ale istoriei* (lyrics; translation: Dumitru M. Ion, Carolina Ilica). București: Editura Academiei Internaționale Orient-Occident 2012.
- 16) Goce Smilevski³⁴, *Sora lui Freud*³⁵ (novel; translation: Octavian Blenchea). Iași: Polirom, 2013.
- 17) Rade Silian, *Umbrele Clîpelor. Versuri*³⁶ (lyrics; translation: Dina Cuvata). Chișinău: Editura Literatura și Arta, 2014.

²⁶ *Египетска сопувалка*. Скопје: Мисла, 2001.

²⁷ Goran Stefanovski (Горан Стефановски; 1952-), Macedonian playwright (established in London), former drama editor at Macedonian Television and teacher at the Faculty of Philology at the ‘St. Kiril and Methodiu’ University (Skopje), thereafter a dramaturgy professor at the drama faculty at the same university, member of WAM, PEN and MASA.

²⁸ *Баханалии*. 1996.

²⁹ *Демонот од Дебар Маало*. 2006.

³⁰ *Приказни од Дивиот исток*. Скопје: Табернакул, 2004.

³¹ The lyrics of Lidija Dimovska in the translation of Constantina Abalutza were also published in the cultural journals: *Viața românească* (Bucharest, 2009), *Contrafort* (Chisinau, 2011), *Arca* (Arad, 2012).

³² Ioana Ieronim also translated Lidija Dimovska's lyrics into the *Luceafărul* magazine (Bucharest, 2012).

³³ Ivan Geparovski (Иван Гепаровски), professor at the Institute of Philosophy at the ‘St. Kiril and Methodiu’ University (Skopje), Macedonian poet.

³⁴ Goce Smilevski (Гоце Смилевски; 1975-), Macedonian writer, one of the best-known contemporary prose writers.

³⁵ *Сестрата на Зигмунд Фројд*. Скопје: Дијалог, 2011.

³⁶ *Сенка на векот*. Скопје: Матница Македонска, 2013.

18) Igor Isakovski³⁷, *Tu dormi aici...*; *Însetat și blând* (poetry). In *România Literară*, 2015).

3. CONCLUSIONS

At first glance, the volume of the authors who have been indexed and of the works listed here, also taking into account the impressive volume of translations preceding the period of time that was the subject of this study, seems to confirm Dimo Dimcev's assertion that currently there are countless translations into Macedonian (*Има многу преоди од романски на македонски*³⁸). Similarly, it can be argued that Macedonian literature is well represented through translations in the Romanian cultural space.

A closer look of the inventory of translations of the two literatures, completed in the last decade and a half, in conjunction with the examination of the translations preceding this period, also highlights other observations. Therefore, other conclusions that can be formulated at this stage of the research would be:

1) The selection of Romanian and Macedonian literary works proposed to be known to the readers of the two spiritual areas is not governed by a common, coherent and fundamentally axiologically solid cultural and editorial policy, being rather the result of very personal, therefore subjective and arbitrary choices. Oftentimes, the selections are less focused on the hierarchies put forward by literary history and critique, however controversial and contradictory these milestones may seem in the light of recent revisions and re-evaluations. Sometimes, these choices appear to be governed by personal and somewhat petty interests, or by the translators' need to satisfy their vanity, often writers themselves. Hence, the large number of self or mutual translations, a phenomenon that could lead a foreign reader to have the distorted image that they and not others would be the emblematic writers of the literature at a given point in time (the contemporary period, in the present case). In support of the above, it is also noteworthy that the most translated authors are, apart from translators-writers, well-known writers who are or were at the time when their translations were published in high public positions or at the top of the hierarchy of administrative structures in the cultural life of the two countries. Fortunately, the value of their artistic creation often confirms the public recognition of the authors in question. Often, not always... This explains why so many niche authors, who are unrepresentative even for a barely acceptable understanding of the true values of the two literatures have been translated from one language into the other. The overall impression, therefore, remains that of an amalgam that is hard to define and quite monotonous.

³⁷ Igor Isakovski (Игор Исаковски; 1970-2014), poet, prose writer, Macedonian translator and editor (radio-tv and several publications).

³⁸ In *Дневник* online, 26.04.2012 (<http://www.dnevnik.mk>).

2) For the time being, public access to the true masterpieces of foreign literature through translation remains impossible. Until now, and especially in the period under review, it turns out that the translators have made many but yet small steps. It is noteworthy in this discussion that even when important and very important writers of one literature or the other were translated into another language, they were not illustrated with their most representative works.

3) Many of the translated titles have a very limited circulation, appearing in a confidential circulation and in niche publishing houses, making them difficult to reach both the general public and the specialists. However, the distribution of translated literature begins to show some signs of adaptation to the current specificity of the editorial market and to resonate with trends in the behaviour of readers of the new generation. Thus, a new and unexpected element for the research period is the emergence of translations in digital format (translations in online publications and in eBook format).

4) With some exceptions, which is absolutely notable, translations of literary works from Romanian into Macedonian and vice versa are the work of self-employed and freelance translators. Very attached to the two cultures, more or less well-versed in both languages, they have trained themselves over time in this field through the force of circumstance. Permanent collaboration with specialists from the other cultural (and linguistic) space is a definite constant of translation in all cases, as is natural. The product of professional or amateur translators, the overwhelming majority of the works outlined here are distinguished by a remarkably good quality.

5) The fundamental recommendation that is almost imperative at the end of this research comes naturally from the partial satisfaction of the general conclusion that translations, in both directions, are not at present capable of reflecting both literatures to their true value.